Science: the last living example of Medieval Art ?

Alessandro Giuliani



Capitolo 2 I fondamenti della Meccanica

9

2.1	Introduzione			
2.2	Cinematica			
	2.2a	Traiettoria e legge oraria	9	
	2.2b	Velocità e accelerazione	10	
	2.2c	Legge oraria di alcuni semplici moti	11	
2.3	3 Le forze e le leggi della Dinamica			
	2.3a	Le forze	16	
	2.3b	I principi della Dinamica	16	
	2.3c	I campi di forze: il campo gravitazionale	19	
	2.3d	Massa, peso e densità	20	
	2.3e	Pseudoforze	21	
2.4	Dalle forze alla legge oraria			
	2.4a	Integrazione dell'equazione di moto	22	
	2.4b	Moto inerziale in assenza di forze	23	
	2.4c	Moto in un campo di forze uniforme	24	
	2.4d	Moto in un campo di forze centrale	25	
	2.4e	Moto in un campo di forze elastiche	25	

Handbook of Physics : Index



Traditional thinking: the issues are independent from their authors

✓ Niccolò Machiavelli Il Principe (ed. a c. di U. Dotti, Milano, Feltrinelli, 1991 e sgg.); La Mandragola (ed. a c. di G. Davico Bonino, Torino, Einaudi, 1992 e sgg.). ✓ Torquato TASSO La Gerusalemme Liberata (ed. a c. di L. Caretti, Milano, Mondadori, 1999 e sgg.): I-VI, XII-XVI, XX. ✓ Carlo GOLDONI La locandiera (ed. a c. di C. Pedretti, Milano, Rizzoli, 2001 e sgg.). ✓ Vittorio ALFIERI La vita (ed. a c. di M. Cerruti e L. Ricaldone, Milano, Rizzoli, 2002 e sgg.); Saul (in: Filippo; Saul, a c. di V. Branca, Milano, Rizzoli, 2000 e sgg.). ✓ Ugo FOSCOLO I sonetti; I Sepolcri (in: Sepolcri, odi, sonetti, a c. di D. Martinelli, Milano, Mondadori, 2001 e sgg.). ✓ Alessandro MANZONI I Promessi Sposi (ed. a c. di E. Raimondi e L. Bottoni,

✓ Giacomo LEOPARDI

Milano, Principato, 2002 e sgg.).

Canti (ed. a c. di N. Gallo e C. Garboli, Torino, Einaudi, 1994 e sgg.): All'Italia, Ad Angelo Mai, Bruto minore, L'ultimo canto di Saffo, La sera del dì di festa, L'infinito, Alla luna, A Silvia, Le ricordanze, Canto notturno d'un pastore errante dell'Asia, Il tramonto della luna;

Operette morali (ed. a c. di C. Galimberti, Napoli,

Handbook of Italian Literature: Index



Modern thinking: the authors decide the relevance of the issues

At the molecular level, rearrangements are thought to result from errors in doublestrand break repair pathways (mainly non-homologous end joining, but also non-allelic homologous recombination) when simultaneous breaks occur in close proximity in the nucleus (Lupski and Stankiewicz,2005; Korbel et al., 2007; Meaburn et al., 2007; Quinlanet al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2012), and, to a lesser extent, from fork stalling and template switching during replication (Shaw and Lupski, 2004; Lee et al., 2007; Kidd et al., 2010).

Scientific work: any statement must be justified by reference to previous works, any novelty is accepted if (and only if) fits with an established tradition.

What for Art ?????...The medieval most influential definition of Art is:

Recta Ratio Factibilium (Thomas the Aquinas, Roccasecca, 1225 – Abbazia di Fossanova, 1274)



The right way to manage what could be done

In Middle Ages the different Arts were considered as a unitary system: no qualitative differences among painters, architects, tailors, carpenters..the value assigned to each single 'piece' was decided by its adherence to *standards*.

Artifact: anything made following *art rules* (*a regola d'arte*, in Italian we still use this term for deciding legal controversies on construction works).

Scientific journals follow the same principles (*peer review*) of Medieval *guilds* (in contemporary language '*community*') and the St. Thomas definition of Art (Science), here below a section of the 'art rules' for a scientific paper to be accepted for publication (PLoS Journals, *Italics added*):

Results must be rigorously and appropriately reported, in keeping with community standards.

•Units of measurement. Clearly define measurement units in all tables and figures.

•Properties of distribution. It should be clear from the text which measures of variance (standard deviation, standard error of the mean, confidence intervals) and central tendency (mean, median) are being presented. •Regression analyses. Include the full results of any regression analysis performed as a supplementary file. Include all estimated regression coefficients, their standard error, p-values, and confidence intervals, as well as the measures of goodness of fit.

•**Reporting parameters.** Test statistics (F/t/r) and associated degrees of freedom should be provided. Effect sizes and confidence intervals should be reported where appropriate. If percentages are provided, the numerator and denominator should also be given.

•**P-values.** Report exact p-values for all values greater than or equal to 0.001. P-values less than 0.001 may be expressed as p < 0.001, or as exponentials in studies of genetic associations.

•Displaying data in plots. Format plots so that they accurately depict the sample distribution. 3D effects in plots can bias and hinder interpretation of values, so avoid them in cases where regular plots are sufficient to display the data.



(Padova, Cappella degli Scrovegni)

Dynamical features in fetal and postnatal zinc-copper metabolic cycles predict the emergence of autism spectrum disorder. (SCIENCE ADVANCES | RESEARCH ARTICLE)

Who did the work ?: Paul Curtin,^{1*†} Christine Austin,^{1*} Austen Curtin,^{1*} Chris Gennings,^{1*} Manish Arora^{1*†} (for the Emergent Dynamical Systems Group), Kristiina Tammimies,^{2,3} Charlotte Willfors,^{2,3} Steve Berggren,^{2,3} Paige Siper,^{4,5} Dheeraj Rai,⁶ Kristin Meyering,^{4,5} Alexander Kolevzon,^{4,5} Josephine Mollon,^{7†} Anthony S. David,⁷ Glyn Lewis,⁸ Stanley Zammit,^{6,9} Lynne Heilbrun,¹⁰ Raymond F. Palmer,¹⁰ Robert O. Wright,¹ Sven Bölte,^{2,3} Abraham Reichenberg^{1,4,5,7†}

Both Medieval Artworks and Contemporary Scientific papers are Collective works

Who did the work ?:

Giotto and co-workers (Bottega di Giotto)....



Renaissance breaks (some) old rules:

1. The most valuable art pieces are 'masterpieces' (works made by a **single** master) individuality overcomes the collective.

2. Painters and Architects flirt with 'Intellectual elites' and separate from Carpenters and Tailors...

... but keeps alive some others:

1. Art plays a crucial social and political role (No *Art pour l'Art* temptations) and thus must adhere to standards (like Science).

2. The '*Committenza*' (Funding Agencies in Science, who puts the money) has a direct influence on the **content** of the work. (No *expressionist* solipsistic temptations).

Protestant Reformation introduces a sharp divide in artistic production, with Catholic world recovering a sort of 'New Universal Medieval Way' and Protestant nations going toward a completely different path.....



Lucas Cranach: portrait of Martin Luther,

Cranach was the painter most directly engaged in Reformation movement.



Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: Magdalene. Caravaggio was the painter most strictly following the Catholic counter-reformation art standards.

Theology of Beauty, 1582

The re-birth of a canon in Catholic Reformation (Concilio di Trento) *figurative art = popular culture (Catholic)* vs. *literature = elite art (Protestant)*

Every person must have the possibility to read the Bible (Luther) Forget reading and look at these beautiful pictures (Paleotti)

GABRIELE PALEOTTI

DISCORSO INTORNO ALLE IMAGINI SACRE E PROFANE

È certo gran meraviglia che, per volere intendere qualche libro, vi sono necessarie si difficili cose, come la cognizione della lingua, il maestro, l'ingegno capace e la commodità d'imparare, tal che la cognizione loro si ristringe solo in pochi, che si chiamano dotti et intelligenti; dove che le pitture servono come libro aperto alla capacità d'ogniuno, per essere composte di linguaggio commune a tutte le sorti di persone, uomini, donne, piccioli, grandi, dotti, ignoranti, e però si lasciano intendere, quando il pittore non le voglia stroppiare, da tutte le nazioni e da tutti gli intelletti, senza altro pedagogo o interprete. Si aggiunge che, con brevità grandissima, anzi in un momento, o più tosto in uno sguardo, fanno capaci subito le persone³³⁶; dove nei libri provano gli eruditi quanto tempo et oglio vi si consuma per intenderli. E quel che più importa è che, non acquistandosi le lettere, o scienze de' libri, se non con gran fatica, travaglio e spesa, dalle imagini siamo ammaestrati con grandissima dolcezza e ricreazione.



The new Catholic Medieval Art (*Bibla Pauperum*, the Bible explained to the illiterate) is Baroque, again no qualitative distinctions among Arts: carpenters, tailor, actors, painters, sculptors, architects .. share the same Canonical Prescriptions

Who did this work?

(Chiesa del Gesù, Roma)

...and where are these churches ?









.. what about Orthodox world ?



(Kazan's Virgin Mary Icon)

...this is a fascinating (but too complex to be told here) story in which the collective, the intimate, the expressionism, the adherence to the standards mix-up in a unique way..... the crucial point is the **Symbol** that makes *Rublev* a strict relative of *Malevich*...





...so let's go back to our science-medieval art parallel ... and make a jump to the end of XIX^{th} century and the beginning of XX^{th}

A scientist worthy of the name, experiences in his work the same impression as an artist; his pleasure is as great and of the same nature. ...we work not only to obtain the positive results which, according to the *profane*, constitute our one and only affection, as to experience this aesthetic emotion and to convey it to others who are capable of experiencing it. (bolded added).



Jules Henri Poincaré (29 April 1854 – 17 July 1912)



Impressionism, the Art of Poincarè times: this famous painting by Claude Monet (1840-1926) echoes the scientist considerations on impression, aesthetic emotion and personal experience.



facebook.com/pedromics

In the beginning of XX century artists and scientists 'sensed' the same crisis: it is the 'cultural transition' fueled by the Second Industrial Revolution:

Science is being transformed into Technology (and **scientists** try to re-affirm their 'master' role by focusing on solitary 'genius' and their unique experience)

Art has no more social role (and **artists** try to re-affirm their 'master' role by focusing on solitary 'genius' and their unique experience)

Art and Science start to consider themselves as esoteric Religions, the *profane* (literally '*who is out of the temple*' in Latin) cannot understand.

The first question (involving both Science and Art) is...who is the profane ?



Pablo Picasso: Harmonium Player



Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: The Seven Works of Mercy

..and the second (related) question is : There is a continuum going from the 'illuminate' to the 'profane' or an unsourmountable divide ?



Frank O'Gehry, Bilbao Library XXI Century



Francesco Borromini, San Carlino alle Quattro Fontane XVII Century

Science in the age of selfies

Donald Geman^{a,1} and Stuart Geman^{b,1}

9384-9387 | PNAS | August 23, 2016 | vol. 113 | no. 34

A time traveler from 1915 arriving in 1965 would have been astonished by the scientific theories and engineering technologies invented during that half century. One can only speculate, but it seems likely that few of the major advances that emerged during those 50 years were even remotely foreseeable in 1915: Life scientists discovered DNA, the genetic code, transcription, and examples of its regulation, yielding, among other insights, the central dogma of biology.

Some of these advances emerged from academia and some from the great industrial research laboratories where pure thinking was valued along with better products. Would a visitor from 1965, having traveled the 50 years to 2015, be equally dazzled?



Essay

Why Most Published Research Findings Are False

John P. A. Ioannidis

Table 4. PPV of Research Findings for Various Combinations of Power $(1 - \beta)$, Ratio of True to Not-True Relationships (R), and Bias (u)

1-β	R	u	Practical Example	PPV
0.80	1:1	0.10	Adequately powered RCT with little bias and 1:1 pre-study odds	0.85
0.95	21	0.30	Confirmatory meta-analysis of good- quality RCTs	0.85
0.80	1:3	0.40	Meta-analysis of small inconclusive studies	0.41
0.20	1:5	0.20	Underpowered, but well-performed phase I/II_RCT	0.23
0.20	1:5	0.80	Underpowered, poorly performed phase I/II RCT	0.17
0.80	1:10	0.30	Adequately powered exploratory epidemiological study	0.20
0.20	1:10	0.30	Underpowered exploratory epidemiological study	0.12
0.20	1:1,000	0.80	Discovery-oriented exploratory research with massive testing	0.0010
0.20	1:1,000	0.20	As in previous example, but with more limited bias (more standardized)	0.0015

Jorge Luis Borges: El Rigor de la Ciencia (On the Exactitude in Science)

.. In that Empire, the Art of Cartography attained such Perfection that the map of a single Province occupied the entirety of a City, and the map of the Empire, the entirety of a Province. In time, those Unconscionable Maps no longer satisfied, and the Cartographers Guilds struck a Map of the Empire whose size was that of the Empire, and which coincided point for point with it. The following Generations, who were not so fond of the Study of Cartography as their Forebears had been, saw that that vast map was Useless, and not without some Pitilessness was it, that they delivered it up to the Inclemencies of Sun and Winters. In the Deserts of the West, still today, there are Tattered Ruins of that Map, inhabited by Animals and Beggars; in all the Land there is no other Relic of the Disciplines of Geography." purportedly from Suárez Miranda, Travels of Prudent Men, Book Four, Ch. XLV, Lérida, 1658

Science as Theater: Too Obvious to Be Appreciated

Alessandro Giuliani

Pavel Florenskij points our attention to the fact 'magic shows' follow a path very similar to the foundation of 'Scientific Truth'





Both in Science and Illusionism we give for granted the existence of shared material experiences we do not investigate further. This is 'pure magic show', probably the most genial scientific experiment of all times, in 1911 Ernst Rutherford shows us the structure of atoms...







It was the most incredible event in my life: incredible as shooting a cannon ball against a piece of paper and looking at the ball coming back and hitting me. .

Ernst Rutherford on his 1911 experiment...





Dimitrji Ivanovic Mendeleev (1834-1907): *Periodic Table* of Elements

A discrete and finite set of 'rules' ('performant symbols' according to the most genuine 'Russian Way') gives rise to an infinite Universe of configurations..*like Music*

The middle way

R. B. Laughlin*, David Pines^{†‡§}, Joerg Schmalian¹¹, Branko P. Stojković^{||}**, and Peter Wolynes^{††}

32-37 | PNAS | January 4, 2000 | vol. 97 | no. 1

Mesoscopic organization in soft, hard, and biological matter is examined in the context of our present understanding of the principles responsible for emergent organized behavior (crystallinity, ferromagnetism, superconductivity, etc.) at long wavelengths in very large aggregations of particles. Particular attention is paid to the possibility that as-yet-undiscovered organizing principles might be at work at the mesoscopic scale, intermediate between atomic and macroscopic dimensions, and the implications of their discovery for biology and the physical sciences. The search for the existence and universality of such rules, the proof or disproof of organizing principles appropriate to the mesoscopic domain, is called the middle way.





log(LC50) = -0.8438 log(Kow) - 2.3078. (validated on hundreds of molecules)



In order to save Science from thermal death we must dare to give up with ultra-experts and try to re-establish a 'continuous spectrum' from avant-garde to simple persons (*Bibla Pauperum ?*) Taking inspiration from Medieval Art.

Short-Cuts like 'Citizen Science' can only accelerate the Apocalypse









(and anxious to know your ideas about..)